

Date: May 31, 2017

To: City Council

From: Christina Day, Director of Planning

Subject: Appeal of a Partial Denial for a Certificate of Appropriateness at 813 18th Street

On May 23, 2017, the Heritage Commission voted 7-0 to partially approve a Certificate of Appropriateness request at 813 18th Street to make exterior alterations to the main structure and construct a one story addition. This memorandum provides a brief summary of the applicant’s CA application and request for appeal.

A CA is required for all exterior building improvements or new construction projects within the Haggard Park Heritage Resource District. Preservation guidelines for Haggard Park have been established and are used in determination of whether to grant or deny CA requests. These guidelines, and the review process through which these guidelines are administered, promote preservation of historic, cultural, and architectural heritage of Haggard Park.

The Heritage Commission first reviewed the CA application for 813 18th Street on April 25, 2017. The CA request included one item that met the preservation guidelines, and was supported by the Commission, and five items that did not meet the preservation guidelines. The Commission worked with the applicant to find compromises with the requested deviations. Below is a summary of this discussion:

Applicant’s Requested Deviation from Preservation Guidelines	Heritage Commission’s Direction	Applicant’s Compromise
Alteration of original roof pitch and building height	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Did not support request 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agreed to not alter the existing building height or roof pitch
Replacement of front porch columns and alteration of the front porch roof pitch/height	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Did not support request 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Agreed to retain the front porch columns and not alter front porch roof pitch/height
Removal and replacement of all existing doors and windows with new material	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supported request 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NA
Replacement of exterior cladding and removal of window awnings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Partially supported request to allow exterior cladding replacement Did not support request to remove awnings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Amended request to leave all exterior cladding in place Agreed to retain the existing window awnings
Construction of a one story addition	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Supported request 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NA

The CA application also had a number of missing items as noted at the meeting. After discussion with the applicant, the Commission unanimously voted to table the CA application for the applicant to provide additional information/documents and to resubmit updated plans that reflect the Commission’s direction and applicant’s compromise. The applicant informed the Commission that his desire was not to resubmit plans, and asked the Commission to approve the CA with the agreed conditions, or deny

the application. The Commission responded by stating they were not comfortable approving the CA application with inaccurate drawings.

The applicant did not submit any updated drawings to staff between the Heritage Commission meetings.

On May 23, 2017, the applicant requested the Commission to approve or deny the original request. Consistent with the direction at the April meeting, the Commission unanimously voted to approve two of the five requested deviations to the preservation guidelines subject to provision of updated drawings. Accurate drawings are needed to protect the safety, health, and well-being of the applicant, the city, and the Haggard Park neighborhood, and to ensure a clear and mutual understanding. In addition, before a building permit can be issued, updated drawings are required by the Building Inspections Department.

An appeal of the decision was received from the applicant the evening of May 23, 2017, which is included as an attachment. Section 16-102 (d) of the Heritage Resource Preservation Ordinance allows the applicant to appeal the Heritage Commission’s decision to City Council. The appeal is for the Heritage Commission’s denied portions of the original CA request, which include:

Applicant’s Requested Deviation from Preservation Guidelines	Request Summary	Haggard Park Preservation Guideline Conformance Summary
Alteration of roof pitch and building height	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Change roof pitch from 5:12 to 7:12 • Increase overall building wall height by 2’-0” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The request does not preserve and/or maintain the existing historic roof slope, eaves, and roofline • Minimal traditional architectural style typically has a low sloped roof • Increasing the overall building height will alter the historic character of the structure
Replacement of front porch columns and alteration of the front porch roof pitch/height	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace two decorative painted wood columns with two wood box columns • Raise the porch ceiling height to match the proposed 2’-0” eave height • Change porch roof pitch from 5:12 to 7:12 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The request would remove the original front porch columns, which are character-defining architecture features • The request does not preserve and/or maintain the existing historic roof slope, eaves, and roofline
Replacement of exterior cladding and removal of window awnings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replace all exterior cladding with wood siding • Remove all original window awnings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replacement of siding on all elevations, excluding the east and west gables, may be appropriate • The request does not preserve and maintain the existing historic details, which include the vertical board siding on the east and west gables and the character-defining window awnings

The City Council may affirm, modify, or reverse the decision of the Commission and may, where appropriate, remand the item to the Commission for future proceedings consistent with Council’s decision.

For informational purposes unrelated to the applicant's request to appeal, a CA application to demolish of the structure has also been submitted. On May 23, 2017 the Heritage Commission unanimously suspended the application for ninety (90) calendar days from the date of the submittal of the application to allow the Commission to work with the applicant in an effort to preserve the structure.

In order to provide additional information for Council's consideration, the following attachments have been included:

1. The Vice Chair report describing the partial approval vote from the Heritage Commission;
2. The staff report and related attachments from the April 25, 2017 and May 23, 2017 Heritage Commission meetings describing the CA request and applicable guidelines in the Haggard Park Preservation Guidelines; and
3. The applicant's letter of request.

Please let me know if you have any questions or need further information.

cc: Bruce Glasscock, City Manager
Jack Carr, Deputy City Manager
Doug McDonald, Comprehensive Planning Manager
Bhavesh Mittal, Heritage Preservation Officer